

Liquidity: A view of how our theories are changing

Charles M. Kahn

Department of Finance

University of Illinois

Everybody "knows" what liquidity is...

BIS: Liquidity is the **ability** to **fund increases in assets** and **meet obligations** as they come due.

Everybody "knows" what liquidity is...

| Assets | Liabilities and Net Worth |
|--------------------|----------------------------|
| Cash Securities | Deposits Borrowed Funds |
| Loans | Equity |

Why do we care about liquidity?

- Issues in finance
 - Existence of liquidity premium and effects on asset pricing
 - Design of financial markets
- Macroeconomic consequences
 - But are they distinct (or is "illiquidity" just a euphemism for "insolvency")?

What is new in recent accounts of liquidity?

Compare some classic treatments with some recent ones

New feature: emphasis on imperfect commitment

- Time line
- Keynes
- Hicks
- Bernanke
- Freixas and Laffont
- Diamond and Dybvig

And then:

Geanakoplos, Holmström and Tirole,
 Brunnermeier and Pedersen, Vayanos and Wang

Keynes in General Theory

- Liquidity is ease of transformation
- Ambiguity:
 - Uncertainty of sale price
 - Locked in to choices
- Liquidity premium for benefit of liquidity services
- Liquidity has the downside of a lack of commitment
- Implicated in economic fluctuation

Hicks

- Value and Capital (1946): dichotomy between liquid assets, usable for transactions, and illiquid ones, not usable
- "Liquidity" (1962): liquid assets have low variance of value
- Crisis in Keynesian Economics (1976): liquidity means flexibility of position

Formal models of flexibility (1970's)

- Frexias and Laffont (1979), Bernanke (1978): irreversibility of real investments requires higher return to undergo them.
- Limitation: for pricing tradable assets—supply and demand both part of story.

Market Microstructure Literature

- Deviations from fundamental value of marketed assets (over very short term horizons)
- Liquidity demanders ("Noise traders"), dealers holding inventories,
- Effects of transactions costs for sales, asymmetric information, density of noise traders, market structure

- "Liquidity and Asset Prices under Asymmetric Information and Imperfect Competition,"
 Review of Financial Studies, 2012
- "Theories of Liquidity" Foundations and Trends in Finance, 2012

 Looks at effects on standard measures of illiquidity in financial markets of standard set of factors:

Transactions costs, Asymmetric information, Search, among others

- Innovation: Noise traders have better motivation than earlier literature: shocks to holdings.
- Because it is equilibrium, standard liquidity measures don't always line up with a priori interpretations

- Rudimentary consideration of funding constraints
- No consideration of contingent contracts or derivatives

Arrow-Debreu and theories of liquidity

- "There is no issue of liquidity in an Arrow-Debreu world"
- Market incompleteness vs underlying physical characteristics

Diamond-Dybvig as case study

"Bank Runs, Deposit Insurance, and Liquidity," JPE, 1983

Diamond-Dybvig

- Cash desirable because tradable, long term loans are not.
- Agent uncertainty about trading needs leads to contingent demand for cash.
- Insurance arrangement (banks) supplies it more efficiently than each individual holding on their own.

Diamond-Dybvig

- Instability, but from suboptimal contractual arrangement.
- Assumes that financial claims on banks are not tradable.
- With private information, reopening trade destroys insurance (Jacklin) – in other words, illiquidity of contract necessary for liquidity provision.

Limited commitment

- Distinctive characteristic of the new accounts
 - For example limited liability
 - Need for collateral
 - Alienable vs inalienable assets
- Take this as the source of missing AD markets

Niehans Theory of Money 1978

 Informal theory of usefulness of assets (here fiat money) as a means of settlement in the presence of a limit to ability to borrow Geanakoplos

- Geanakoplos and Zame "Collateralized Security Markets," 1997 et seq.
- "The Leverage Cycle," 2010.

Geanakoplos

- Borrowing includes specification of collateral haircuts: loans with different haircuts are different AD commodities.
- Differences in priors as source of trading
 - In principle not necessary, but gives result that agents choose limited number of collateral terms
 - In simple applications, collateral level chosen endogenously to rule out default

Geanakoplos implications

- Collateralizable assets trade at premium to non-collateralizable equivalents
- Collateral terms can have greater variation than prices themselves as state shifts

Endpoint

- Macroeconomic consequences:
- Effects from changes in relative price of pledgeable and non pledgeable assets
- Collateral spirals
- Need for linkage between bad news and variability of news

Holmström Tirole

Inside and Outside Liquidity, 2011

- But source of demand for liquidity is limited liability
 - You can't force repayment; only extractible wealth is liquid.
 - More subtly: you can't force effort through punishments.

Holmström Tirole

- New dichotomy: pledgeable assets fully contractible, non pledgeable assets uncontractible.
- As a result, liquidity can be reallocated in the economy. Aggregate pledgeable stuff only constraint.
- Role for government in improving the situation through its taxing power allowing more contingent liquidity provision.

Brunnermeier and Pedersen

"Market Liquidity and Funding Liquidity" RFS 2009

- Market liquidity vs funding liquidity (Hicks liquidity of asset vs liquidity of position)
- Margins <u>and</u> haircuts must be funded: in other words not just long side not pledgeable.

Brunnermeier and Pedersen

- In <u>other</u>, other words, going through particular individuals reduces overall liquidity.
- (Admits cross margining would reduce this)
- Regulatory explanation

Summary

Fundamental shift in understanding macroeconomic significance of liquidity Role of flexibility replaced by role of limit to commitment.

Next challenge: incorporating role of counterparties

My liquidity-related work:

- "Equilibrium Pricing Models for Illiquid Assets," PhD Dissertation 1981
- "A Competitive Efficiency Wage Model with Keynesian Features" QJE 1988 with Dilip Mookherjee
- "The Role of Demandable Debt in Structuring Optimal Banking Arrangements" AER 1991 with Charles Calomiris
- "Ownership Structure, Speculation and Shareholder Information" JF 1998 with Andrew Winton
- "Payment System Settlement and Bank Incentives," RFS 1998 with William Roberds
- "Settlement Risk under Gross and Net Settlement," JMCB 2003 with William Roberds and James McAndrews
- "Transferability, Finality and Debt Settlement," JME 2007 with William Roberds
- "Why Pay? An Introduction to Payments Economics," JFI 2009 with William Roberds
- "Payments Settlement: Tiering in Private and Public Systems" JMCB 2009 with William Roberds
- "Private Payment Systems, Collateral, and Interest Rates" Annals of Finance 2013
- "Sources of Liquidity and Liquidity Shortages" 2013 with Wolf Wagner

