Sovereign Defaults in the Euro Area: the Legal Perspective

Jörn Axel Kämmerer

Overview

- I. Sovereign Default: the Ambiguous European Approach
 - 1. Sovereign Default as Dealt with by Sovereign States and the IMF
 - 2. Sovereign Default from an EU Perspective: To Bail or not to Bail?
 - 3. The Greek Crisis: a Lawful Change of Paradigms?
- II. Perspectives for a European State Insolvency Regime
 - Grinding Scissors for a "Haircut" the Lingering Need for a Sounder, and Composite, Approach
 - Saying Farewell: Alternative Ways of Sovereign Debt Restructuring?

Dealing with Sovereign Default: Strategies



- Solidarity within the federal order
- Equalization payments (horizontal, vertical)
- Payment is unconditional
- Threat of default not required
- → De facto bailout

Default prevention
No insolvency mechanism





- International community assists defaulting States
- Loans (based on stand-by arrangements)
- Payment subject to sovereign restructuring / austerity policy

Default management "Case to case" insolvency



Pro Solidarity

EU as (quasi-)federal regime

Monetary Policy (exclusive EU competence)

Art. 143 – assistance in the event of difficulties flowing from balance of payments

Art. 122 para. 2

(Art. 122 para. 1, 222, ...)

Pro Self-responsibility

EU as a non-State

Economic Policy (exclusive EU competence)

Art. 125 – no bailout

• Prohibition of voluntary assistance by MS?

Art. 126 – deficit thresholds

(Art. 121, 123, 124, ...)

Financial support pursuant to Art. 122 para. 2 TFEU

Natural disasters or

Exceptional occurrences beyond its control

(Severe) Difficulties



- Financial assistance to MS
- Discretion (as for assistance)
- "Certain conditions" to be attached (no discretion)
- Competent: Council (qualified majority), upon proposal by COM

The Greek Crisis: a Lawful Change of Paradigms?

Financial support by Member States

- Permissive only where TFEU provides for exceptions from Art. 125
- Not covered by Art. 122 para. 2 TFEU ("Union financial assistance")
- No limited participation of MS as for voting and refinancing
- Limited participation under Art. 126, 136 does not encompass financial support as such
- Art. 352 not applicable

The European Stabilization Fund

- Legal background: Art. 122 para. 2 TFEU
- Regulation on European Financial Stabilization Mechanism
- "Special Purpose Vehicle"

Perspectives for a European State Insolvency Regime

Deficiency of anti-default mechanism

- Ban on bailout is being overthrown
- Fragility and limited efficiency
- Own creditworthiness of bails is at stake

Structural hurdles

- Extension of Economic Union ("economic government") would require deviation from Art. 125
- Amendment of TFEU unrealistic and timeconsuming
- Constitutional reservations

Suggestion for a "composite approach", encompassing ...

- Elements of State insolvency ("haircut" / participation of IMF)
- (Limited) solidarity among MS (Art. 122 para. 2, 143 TFEU)

←→ Withdrawal / expulsion from € Area?





